## Automotive Diesel Fuel Supply - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation - October 2010

|       | Company: Halls Fuels<br>WEIGHTING MATRIX   |           |                 |                              |                |                   |                 |  |  |  |
|-------|--|-----------|-----------------|------------------------------|----------------|-------------------|-----------------|--|--|--|
|       | Evaluation Criteria                        | Weighting | Maximum<br>Mark | Maximum<br>Weighted<br>Score | Actual<br>Mark | Weighted<br>score | Convert<br>to % |  |  |  |
|       | Most Economically Advantageous Tender      |           |                 |                              |                |                   |                 |  |  |  |
| (i)   | Specification compliance and quality merit | 40        | 40              | 1600                         | 40             | 1600              | 100             |  |  |  |
| (ii)  | Price                                      | 40        | 40              | 1600                         | 20             | 800               | 50              |  |  |  |
| (iii) | Certainty of supplies                      | 5         | 6               | 30                           | 6              | 30                | 100             |  |  |  |
| (iv)  | Delivery conditions                        | 5         | 6               | 30                           | 6              | 30                | 100             |  |  |  |
| (v)   | Relevant environmental characteristics     | 5         | 2               | 10                           | 2              | 10                | 100             |  |  |  |
| (vi)  | Qualification Questionnaire response       | 5         | 6               | 30                           | 6              | 30                | 100             |  |  |  |
|       |  | 100       | 100             | 3300                         | 80             | 2500              | 75.76           |  |  |  |
|       |  |           |                 |                              |                |                   |                 |  |  |  |

## Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation.

| Halls Fuels                |                                     | Maximum Points Available |     | Non Compliance         | Compliance                  | Actual Points Scor |  |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|-----|------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|--|
|                            |                                     |                          |     | (Comment)              |                             |                    |  |
| General Requirements       | Insolvent bankrupt                  |                          |     | Remove supplier        | None - Questionnaire        |                    |  |
|                            | Questionnaire completed             |                          | 2   |                        | Completed                   |                    |  |
|                            | Public Liability Insurance cover    |                          | 2   |                        | Current Certificates        |                    |  |
|                            | ISO 14001 :2004                     |                          | 2   |                        | Certification included      |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 6   |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
| Specification (Quality)    |                                     |                          | 25  | Cetane Index not given | Typical property ranges     |                    |  |
|                            | Bunkered supplies - temperature?    |                          | 15  | Bur                    | nkered supplies at terminal |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 40  |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
| Price                      | Platts Mid CIF NW Europe used       |                          | 5   |                        | Yes                         |                    |  |
|                            | Pricing formula & CF (I/t) supplied |                          | 5   |                        | Not supplied                |                    |  |
|                            | Premium add-on (ppl) for ZSD        |                          | 5   |                        | 1.50 ppl                    |                    |  |
|                            | Period of Fixed price               |                          | 5   |                        | Two years                   |                    |  |
|                            | Historical data supplied            |                          | 5   |                        | Not supplied                |                    |  |
|                            | Surcharge small loads               |                          | 5   |                        | Not stated                  |                    |  |
|                            | Discount - prompt payment           |                          | 5   |                        | Not stated                  |                    |  |
|                            | Comparative whole contract cost     |                          | 5   |                        | Only tender submitted       |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 40  |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
| Certainty of Supplies      |                                     |                          | 2   |                        | Yes, 3 years plus current   |                    |  |
|                            | Bankers details/reference supplied  |                          | 2   |                        | Yes, reference supplied     |                    |  |
|                            | Where is diesel fuel supply made?   |                          | 2   |                        | Fawley, Southampton         |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 6   |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
| <b>Delivery Conditions</b> | Delivery within 7 days?             |                          | 2   | Not stated             | Contract Requirement        |                    |  |
|                            | Delivery between 09.00 & 12.00 hrs  | ?                        | 2   | Not stated             | Contract Requirement        |                    |  |
|                            | Separate Invoice/load delivered?    |                          | 2   | Not stated             | Contract Requirement        |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 6   |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
| Environment                | Environmental Policy                |                          | 2   |                        | Statement included          |                    |  |
|                            |                                     | Sub-total points =       | 2   |                        |                             | Sub-total points   |  |
|                            |                                     | Total Points =           | 100 |                        |                             | Total Points       |  |

## Supply of Automotive Diesel Fuel - EU Advertised Tender Evaluation

| Suppliers Name:   | Halls Fuels a Division of Watson Petroleum              | <b>Carlton Fuels Limited</b>   |
|---|---|--|
| Suppliers Name.   |   | Carlton House, Gores Road, Knowsley  |
| Tender Requirements   | Brinkworth, Chippenham, Wiltshire SN15 5DN 01784 248659 | Industrial Park (North), Merseyside L33<br>7XS - Tel. 0151 546 6660, Paul Vian |
| General Requirements  |   | Current Supplier   |
| Questionnaire completed?  | Yes   |  |
| Form of Tender signed by authorised party?  | Yes   | No Tender Submitted  |
| Anti-collusion Certificate signed?  | Yes   |  |
| Public Liability Insurance for £10,000,000?   | Yes - £20,000,000 renewal date 01/05/11                 |  |
| Claims under Firm's Professional Indemnity?   | None recorded   |  |
| Specification (Quality)   |   |  |
| Typical Properties - 'Zero' Sulphur Diesel  |   |  |
| Sulphur (ISO20846) 10 ppm   | 8 mg/kg Esso Typical                                    |  |
| Density (IP365) 840 kg/m <sup>3</sup>   | 833 kg/m <sup>3</sup> Esso Typical                      |  |
| Cetane number (ISO5165) 55  | 54.4 Esso Typical                                       |  |
| Cetane Index (ISO4264) 53   | Not stated but typical Cetane Number provided           |  |
|   | 324 microns Esso Typical                                |  |
| Lubricity (ISO12156-1) 400 microns<br>Viscosity (IP71) 3.0 cSt.                     | 2 Esso Typical  |  |
|   |   |  |
| Measured from bunkered supplies at ambient  | Esso Purfleet Terminal London Rd., Purfleet, Essex      |  |
| temperature. Any cooling after loading and  | Esso West London Terminal Stanwell, Staines, Middx.     |  |
| discharge into Council's storage tanks to be no                                     |   |  |
| more than 5 degrees Celcius.  |   |  |
|   |   |  |
|   |   |  |
| Platts EN590:2004 NW Europe Mid CIF   | Yes   |  |
| Pricing formula used included?  | Only in part  |  |
| Details of Historic Pricing Fluctuations?   | No  |  |
| Litres/tonne conversion rate? (CF)  | Not stated  |  |
| FT daily exchange rate?   | Not stated  |  |
| ppl base as of 22 November 2010 pricing:  | 99.01   |  |
| Tender price £ per litre (excl. VAT) Zero S D                                       | 1.50 pence per litre premium above Platts               |  |
| ppl charge as of 22 November 2010   | 100.5100  |  |
| Current supplier ppl as of 22 November 2010   | 100.0063  |  |
| Tender/Current charge difference per litre  | 0.5037  |  |
| Additional cost for small load - ppl surcharge                                      | Not stated  |  |
| Delivery included?  | Not stated  |  |
| Payment terms?  | Not stated  |  |
| For what period the tender price is fixed for?                                      | 9th February 2011 to 8th February 2013                  |  |
| Formula basis for any price increase?   | Not stated  |  |
| Early payment discount?   | Not stated  |  |
| Relative Cost over Contract Term  |   |  |
| 467,800 litres/annum @ base price + Premiums  | C4 005 404  |  |
| (Apply margin over Platts for 2 year term and estimated margin for two years after) | £1,885,421  |  |
| Certainty of Supplies   |   |  |
|   |   |  |
| Financial standing - Company Accounts given?  | Yes, £585 million annual turnover 2009/10               |  |
| - Bankers reference permitted/letter supplied?                                      |   |  |
| - Any Bankruptcy?   |   |  |
| Guarantee by Parent Company offered?  | No  |  |
| Experience - Company history? Co. Group?  | Company reg. 20/11/57 no. 594001 - No Co. group         |  |
| Where Diesel fuel made?   | Fawley Refinery, Southampton                            |  |
| Delivery Conditions   |   |  |
|   |   |  |
| Within 7 days of order?   | Not stated  |  |
| Delivery between 9.00 and 12.00 hrs?  | Not stated  |  |
| Surcharge on 27,000 litres?   | Not stated  |  |
| Separate invoice sent per load delivered?   | Not stated  |  |